

**Council of Councils
Working Group on the Use of Chimpanzees in NIH-Supported Research
National Institutes of Health
Bethesda, Maryland
Meeting Minutes
April 4, 2012 Teleconference**

Working Group Members Present

Daniel Geschwind, M.D., Ph.D. (Co-Chair)
K.C. Kent Lloyd, D.V.M., Ph.D. (Co-Chair)
R. Alta Charo, J.D.
Beatrice Hahn, M.D.

Stanley Lemon, M.D.
Daniel J. Povinelli, Ph.D.
Stephen Ross, Ph.D.
Patricia Turner, M.Sc., D.V.M., D.V.Sc.

Working Group Members Absent

Charles Rice, Ph.D.

NIH Staff Present

James M. Anderson, M.D., Ph.D.
Lora Kutkat
Betina Orezzaoli

**I. Welcome and Introductions
James M. Anderson, M.D., Ph.D.**

Dr. James Anderson opened the meeting and asked staff to make administrative announcements. Ms. Kutkat reminded the Working Group that any material made available, as well as discussions that take place, are strictly confidential and may not be disclosed or discussed with anyone who has not been officially designated to participate in the Working Group. She informed the members that the nondisclosure agreement signed for the February 2, 2012 meeting is still in effect.

Dr. Anderson said that the purpose of this meeting was to 1) hear a report from Drs. Povinelli and Ross on their February 28, 2012 follow up discussion with Dr. Jeffrey Kahn of the IOM committee; 2) choose 5 or 6 grants to discuss together as a guide for reviewing all other grants; and 3) discuss the proposed site visits to Yerkes Regional Primate Research Center, Bioqual, New Iberia, and Chimp Haven. Members also were updated on the May 14-15, 2012 meeting at the Marina del Rey Marriott Hotel in Los Angeles, CA.

II. Report of Sub-Group Conference Call with Jeffrey Kahn Daniel J. Povinelli, Ph.D., and Stephen Ross, Ph.D.

A conference call with Dr. Kahn on February 28 focused on gathering additional interpretation of the IOM report and the rationale behind key aspects of the report that will affect its implementation.

During the call, Dr. Kahn explained that the distinction in biomedical versus behavioral research comes directly from the charge given to the committee and was not an outcome of its deliberations. He stated that the criteria the committee ultimately agreed on was very narrow and would preclude most biomedical research with chimpanzees. That is, a) no other model is suitable, b) the research cannot be performed with humans, and c) forgoing the use of chimpanzees would significantly slow scientific advancement. Dr. Kahn explained that the criterion regarding minimizing pain and distress is a universal IACUC requirement, and need not be singled out for behavioral and cognitive studies.

When asked about the term “acquiescence,” Dr. Kahn noted that it is a new term and acknowledged the ambiguous nature of the word. He clarified that the group purposely settled on acquiescent to generally mean “not unwilling.” Dr. Kahn also described IOM’s development of the term “ethologically appropriate habitats,” as it applies across all chimpanzee research, and how it might be applied to assessing current and future housing standards. He acknowledged that the scope of possible standards listed in the IOM report were wide ranging and this was intended to reflect the scope of standards that might be considered when establishing standards for the appropriate settings for housing chimpanzees.

III. Discussion of Grants All Working Group Members, with the exception of those with Conflicts

Working Group participants agreed to review a small subset of grants to help inform the upcoming, comprehensive grant review in May. The focus was to raise critical issues in how to move forward on defining the review process, and serve as a preliminary review session to highlight issues that are likely to emerge in the research protocols. The following grants were discussed: #3584, 2710, and 2380.

The following themes emerged from the preliminary grant review:

- NIH may be asked to obtain additional information from the PIs on a project-by-project basis.
- Additional information is especially needed to assess and define “ethologically appropriate” environments.
- Some discussion surrounded how immediate the advancement to the public health must be to justify the use of chimpanzees.
- Projects utilizing blood or other specimens already collected for clinical purposes need not be reviewed.

IV. Chimpanzee Facility Visits Daniel Povinelli, Ph.D.

Dr. Povinelli said that in order to make a useful assessment of the meaning of ethologically appropriate settings, Working Group members will plan to visit some of the centers.

V. May 14-15, 2012 Meeting

The Hill Group discussed meeting and travel logistics for the meeting at Marina del Rey Marriott. Information will be sent via email.