

**Division of Program Coordination, Planning, and Strategic Initiatives**  
**Office of the Director, National Institutes of Health**  
**Draft Meeting Minutes, Council of Councils Working Group Teleconference**  
**11:30 a.m. to 1:30 p.m., Friday, October 5, 2012**

**Working Group Participants:** Alan Barrett, R. Alta Charo, Daniel Geschwind, Beatrice Hahn, K.C. Kent Lloyd, Stephen Ross, and Patricia Turner

**NIH Staff:** James M. Anderson, Lora Kutkat, and Betina Orezzaoli

**Confidentiality and Non-Disclosure**

Ms. Kutkat reminded participants of the rules governing confidentiality and non-disclosure that are in effect for all participants on the call.

**Announcements**

Dr. Anderson reported that Daniel J. Povinelli has resigned from the working group. In addition, Dr. Anderson asked working group members to refer any media calls about the working group's activities to the NIH. The press office at NIH will handle media inquiries.

**Approval of Previous Meeting Minutes**

The working group made the following decisions about the minutes of its previous meetings:

- February 2, 2012: Approve
- February 24, 2012: Approve
- August 1, 2012: Approve after recommended edits are made.
- September 20, 2012: Reconsider after Ms. Kutkat edits the "Institute of Medicine Report Clarifications" section to include language Dr. Ross will provide.

**Chimpanzee Statistics**

Dr. Anderson reported that NIH has posted spreadsheets on the working group's SharePoint site that provide current data on chimpanzees currently owned or supported by NIH. NIH is developing a summary of requests to use chimpanzees for research over the past 30 years. Another document on the SharePoint site provides details on the costs (as of October 31, 2011) associated with the long-term care of chimpanzees owned by NIH. All of this information will help the working group assess the number of chimpanzees that NIH might need to support for future research.

During its discussion of these data, the working group suggested that NIH should talk to primate facilities to also gather data on requests they received.

**Plans for Retired Chimpanzees at New Iberia Research Center**

Dr. Hahn reported that the working group plans to send a letter to NIH about the recent NIH decision to retire the 110 NIH-owned chimpanzees at the New Iberia Research Center by moving 90 to the Texas Biomedical Research Institute and 20 to Chimp Haven. Among other things, the letter will clarify that the working group will encourage NIH to consider other options for providing an ethologically appropriate environment for this population of chimpanzees.

## **Working Group Subgroup Updates**

### Ethologically Appropriate Environment Subgroup

Dr. Ross summarized the draft recommendations of the Ethologically Appropriate Environment Subgroup (available on the SharePoint site). This document recommends standards for ethologically appropriate social and physical environments (EASPEs) for chimpanzees used in research based on the physical and social environments of chimpanzees in the wild. The document also describes the pros and cons of different strategies to create EASPEs, the core components of EASPEs, and a tier-based system for categorizing the environments in which research chimpanzees are housed. Working group members pointed out that the subgroup's document needs to address management principles emphasizing performance standards more so than engineering standards, which are an important component of EASPEs.

### Future Size and Placement of Colony Subgroup

Dr. Hahn summarized the draft document of the Future Size and Placement Subgroup. This document identifies the potential need for chimpanzees for NIH studies that involve no or very little harm and studies that involve invasive procedures. The document describes several options for ensuring that NIH-supported chimpanzees are housed in ethologically appropriate environments and discusses the placement of chimpanzees for public health emergencies.

### **Recommendations Regarding Current NIH Grants**

The co-chairs will present the working group's final recommendations on all projects currently funded by NIH that use chimpanzees to the Council of Councils on October 29, 2012. The group discussed ways to ensure that chimpanzees used for NIH-sponsored research are housed in ethologically appropriate facilities while being fair to investigators who submitted applications to NIH before the NIH accepted the IOM principles and the working group issues its recommendations to the NIH on how to implement the IOM principles. The group decided to establish a category of "conditionally approved to continue". This new category has been defined to indicate that a currently active project (grant, contract, intramural research, 3rd part project, resource/centers) may continue as proposed until the end of the current project period (e.g., next competitive renewal) or until the PI and/or NIH end the project before the next competitive renewal. Further, that part of the project that applies to research active and/or research inactive chimpanzees would not be eligible for no-cost-extension or other means to extend the original term of the project. Continued maintenance, husbandry, welfare, and veterinary care of research active and/or research inactive chimpanzees will be at the discretion of the NIH as and until suitable, ethologically appropriate environments become available. Moreover, "conditionally approved to continue" does not imply or warrant the extent to which the environment meets ethologically appropriate criteria for research active and/or research inactive chimpanzees as defined by the WG. Finally, should the PI elect to submit a competitive renewal application, that application will be reviewed under the criteria established for the use of chimpanzees in research. The working group will recommend that awards for competing research involving chimpanzees would need to satisfactorily address EASPEs.

The working group noted that the changes required to provide ethologically appropriate housing for chimpanzees will be extensive and will therefore require substantial amounts of time and

resources. The group discussed whether to have NIH establish a timeframe for researchers to ensure that the chimpanzees used in their research are housed in an EASPE or to develop a plan to ensure that the chimpanzees are housed in such an environment. The timeframe would be based on the extent of changes needed. At the end of that period, a review panel would determine whether the facility has made the necessary changes.

**Action Steps-**

- NIH will clarify which NIH-owned or NIH-supported chimpanzees are used in more than one study and provide details on the 110 chimpanzees at Chimp Haven in its chimpanzee status spreadsheet.
- Working group members will provide feedback on the draft documents of the Ethologically Appropriate Environment and Future Size and Placement subgroups.
- Drs. Lloyd and Geschwind will develop a draft description of the “conditionally-approved to continue” category for currently funded NIH grants that use chimpanzees. Working group members will provide feedback on this draft material. The final definition for this new category is now incorporated into the minutes above.